DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 476 502 SO 034 856

| | |
|---|---|
| AUTHOR | Abadzi, Helen |
| TITLE | Project Performance Assessment Report on the Maldives: Education and Training Project (Credit 1981) and Second Education and Training Project (Credit 2701). |
| INSTITUTION | World Bank, Washington, DC. |
| REPORT NO | R-25117 |
| PUB DATE | 2002-11-13 |
| NOTE | 29p.; Prepared by the Sector and Thematic Group, Operations Evaluation Department. Cover title varies. |
| AVAILABLE FROM | The World Bank, 1818 H Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20433. Tel: 800-645-7247 (Toll Free); Fax: 703-661-1501; Web site: http://www.worldbank.org/ . |
| PUB TYPE | Reports - Evaluative (142) |
| EDRS PRICE | EDRS Price MF01 Plus Postage. PC Not Available from EDRS |
| DESCRIPTORS | Developing Nations; Educational Benefits; Fellowships; Foreign Countries; Performance Based Assessment; *Program Evaluation; Secondary Education |
| IDENTIFIERS | *Maldives |

ABSTRACT

The Operations Evaluation Department (OED) assesses the programs and activities of the World Bank for two purposes: (1) to ensure the integrity of the World Bank's self-evaluation process and to verify that their work effort is producing the expected results; and (2) to help develop improved directions, policies, and procedures through the dissemination of lessons drawn from experience. A Project Performance Assessment Report (PPAR) is based on a review of the Implementation Committee Report (a self-evaluation by the responsible Bank department) and fieldwork conducted by the OED. This PPAR covers the two completed education projects in the Maldives: (1) Education and Training Project (Credit 1981--Maldives), and (2) Second Education and Training Project (Credit 2701 MAL). The PPAR contains the five sections: (1) "Principal Ratings"; (2) "Key Staff Responsible"; (3) "Preface" (Background; Objectives and Implementation of the Assessed Projects; Ratings; Issues for Future Consideration); (4) "Annex A. Project Activities"; and (5) "Annex B. Basic Data Sheet." The report finds that the fellowships program funded under the two projects brought about considerable benefits in terms of human resource development and that the vast majority of recipients voluntarily returned and assumed positions of responsibility in the government and the private sector. It notes that, for both projects, outcome is rated highly satisfactory. (BT)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 476 502

**Document of**
**The World Bank**

**Report No. 25117**

# PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT REPORT

## MALDIVES

## EDUCATION AND TRAINING PROJECT (CREDIT 1981)
## SECOND EDUCATION AND TRAINING PROJECT (CREDIT 2701)

**November 13, 2002**

SO 034 856

*Sector and Thematic Evaluation Group*
*Operations Evaluation Department*

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE, AND IN ELECTRONIC MEDIA FOR ERIC COLLECTION SUBSCRIBERS ONLY, HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

J. Feather

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

2A

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

**Currency Equivalents** (annual averages)
*Currency Unit = Rufiyaa (Rf)*

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 1996 | US$1.00 | $11.52 |
| 2001 | US$1.00 | $11.77 |

## Abbreviations and Acronyms

| | |
|---|---|
| ADB | Asian Development Bank |
| GDP | Gross domestic product |
| ICR | Implementation Completion Report |
| LIL | Learning and Innovation Lending |
| MIS | Management Information System |
| NGO | Non-governmental Organization |
| OED | Operations Evaluation Department |
| PPAR | Project Performance Assessment Report |
| QAG | Quality Assurance Group |
| TVET | Technical and vocational education and training |
| UNESCO | United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization |

* As of July 1, 2001, Project Performance Audits have been renamed Project Performance Assessments

## Fiscal Year

Government: January 1 – December 31

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| Director-General, Operations Evaluation | : | Mr. Gregory K. Ingram |
| Director, Operations Evaluation Department | : | Mr. Nils Fostvedt (Acting) |
| Manager, Sector and Thematic Evaluation | | Mr. Alain Barbu |
| Task Manager | : | Ms. Helen Abadzi |

**The World Bank**
Washington, D C 20433
U S A

Office of the Director-General
Operations Evaluation

November 13, 2002

## MEMORANDUM TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS AND THE PRESIDENT

**SUBJECT: Project Performance Assessment Report on the Maldives**
Education and Training Project (Credit 1981-MAL), and
Second Education and Training Project (Credit 2701-MAL)

This is a Performance Assessment Report (PAR) on two education projects in the Maldives:

- ***Education and Training Project (Credit 1981–MAL)*** for US$8.19 million equivalent, which was approved in on January 26, 1989. The loan was completed on time and closed on December 31, 1995. An undisbursed balance of US$200,000 was cancelled.

- ***Second Education and Training Project (Credit 2701–MAL)*** for US$13.4 million equivalent, which was approved on April 11, 1995. The loan was completed on time, disbursed completely, and closed on June 30, 2000.

The IDA human resource development strategy for the Maldives was relevant to the country's economic needs, and the objectives of the projects have been relevant to the human resource development needs of the country. IDA has helped the government to carry out its clearly planned strategies and helped promote efficiency in the implementation of large-scale programs.

The fellowships program funded under the two projects has brought about considerable benefits in terms of human resource development. The vast majority of recipients voluntarily returned and assumed positions of responsibility in the government and the private sector, thus significantly improving the availability of well-trained staff within just a few years. However, the strategy of educating students up to grade 12 in hopes of decreasing the number of foreign secondary-level teachers is only partly effective. Many students are not interested in teaching, and many successful teachers who obtain foreign fellowships are then promoted to supervisors and administrators, leaving teaching to foreign recruits. Schools have an unusually large number of administrative positions, which absorb the trained staff. Thus, a pattern is developing of a top-heavy administration consisting of Maldivians that manage foreign teachers in the country's secondary schools.

For both projects, **outcome** is rated **highly satisfactory**. **Institutional development** is rated **substantial**, and **sustainability** as **likely**. **Bank performance** is rated **satisfactory**, and **borrower performance** is rated **highly satisfactory**.

**Lessons**

Experience with the projects confirms a number of OED lessons from education projects:

- Government commitment is critical for success. This lesson has been repeated often, yet this commitment has been particularly important for the success of these projects.

- In small countries, projects often have components involving multiple ministries. These can be successfully implemented when there is a strong stakeholder commitment to reform and when there is political and administrative commitment to setting and achieving high-quality standards.

- In addition to academic qualifications, criteria for awarding fellowships should include work experience and activities indicating leadership ability.

- The extensive use as supervisors of well-trained and dedicated teachers to support other teachers may significantly promote high achievement. However, the persons designated as supervisors usually no longer have teaching duties. Thus effective teacher support may result in taking good staff out of the classroom.

- An increase in the supply of teachers is not automatically related to the provision of suitable education. The social and economic challenges of the profession make it attractive to fewer people than countries often need. Suitable incentives are needed to create a pool of qualified and effective teachers.

- Small countries face challenges in creating human resources who require tertiary-level training. Fellowship programs need components of cost recovery, clear prioritizing of local needs, and clear selection criteria to raise the population's confidence level regarding the impartiality of selections.

- Training abroad as opposed to running costly and inefficient small national institutions (as done by most of the Pacific countries) may be a more economical and efficient means to reduce key skill shortages.

Attachment

**OED Mission: Enhancing development effectiveness through excellence and independence in evaluation.**

**About this Report**

The Operations Evaluation Department assesses the programs and activities of the World Bank for two purposes: first, to ensure the integrity of the Bank's self-evaluation process and to verify that the Bank's work is producing the expected results, and second, to help develop improved directions, policies, and procedures through the dissemination of lessons drawn from experience. As part of this work, OED annually assesses about 25 percent of the Bank's lending operations. In selecting operations for assessment, preference is given to those that are innovative, large, or complex; those that are relevant to upcoming studies or country evaluations; those for which Executive Directors or Bank management have requested assessments; and those that are likely to generate important lessons. The projects, topics, and analytical approaches selected for assessment support larger evaluation studies.

A Project Performance Assessment Report (PPAR) is based on a review of the Implementation Completion Report (a self-evaluation by the responsible Bank department) and fieldwork conducted by OED. To prepare PPARs, OED staff examine project files and other documents, interview operational staff, and in most cases visit the borrowing country for onsite discussions with project staff and beneficiaries. The PPAR thereby seeks to validate and augment the information provided in the ICR, as well as examine issues of special interest to broader OED studies.

Each PPAR is subject to a peer review process and OED management approval. Once cleared internally, the PPAR is reviewed by the responsible Bank department and amended as necessary. The completed PPAR is then sent to the borrower for review; the borrowers' comments are attached to the document that is sent to the Bank's Board of Executive Directors. After an assessment report has been sent to the Board, it is disclosed to the public

**About the OED Rating System**

The time-tested evaluation methods used by OED are suited to the broad range of the World Bank's work. The methods offer both rigor and a necessary level of flexibility to adapt to lending instrument, project design, or sectoral approach. OED evaluators all apply the same basic method to arrive at their project ratings. Following is the definition and rating scale used for each evaluation criterion (more information is available on the OED website: http://worldbank.org/oed/eta-mainpage.html).

***Relevance of Objectives:*** The extent to which the project's objectives are consistent with the country's current development priorities and with current Bank country and sectoral assistance strategies and corporate goals (expressed in Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers, Country Assistance Strategies, Sector Strategy Papers, Operational Policies). *Possible ratings:* High, Substantial, Modest, Negligible.

***Efficacy:*** The extent to which the project's objectives were achieved, or expected to be achieved, taking into account their relative importance. *Possible ratings:* High, Substantial, Modest, Negligible.

***Efficiency:*** The extent to which the project achieved, or is expected to achieve, a return higher than the opportunity cost of capital and benefits at least cost compared to alternatives. *Possible ratings:* High, Substantial, Modest, Negligible. This rating is not generally applied to adjustment operations.

***Sustainability:*** The resilience to risk of net benefits flows over time. *Possible ratings:* Highly Likely, Likely, Unlikely, Highly Unlikely, Not Evaluable.

***Institutional Development Impact:*** The extent to which a project improves the ability of a country or region to make more efficient, equitable and sustainable use of its human, financial, and natural resources through: (a) better definition, stability, transparency, enforceability, and predictability of institutional arrangements and/or (b) better alignment of the mission and capacity of an organization with its mandate, which derives from these institutional arrangements. Institutional Development Impact includes both intended and unintended effects of a project. *Possible ratings:* High, Substantial, Modest, Negligible.

***Outcome:*** The extent to which the project's major relevant objectives were achieved, or are expected to be achieved, efficiently. *Possible ratings:* Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Moderately Unsatisfactory, Unsatisfactory, Highly Unsatisfactory.

***Bank Performance:*** The extent to which services provided by the Bank ensured quality at entry and supported implementation through appropriate supervision (including ensuring adequate transition arrangements for regular operation of the project) *Possible ratings:* Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Unsatisfactory, Highly Unsatisfactory.

***Borrower Performance:*** The extent to which the borrower assumed ownership and responsibility to ensure quality of preparation and implementation, and complied with covenants and agreements, towards the achievement of development objectives and sustainability. Possible ratings: Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Unsatisfactory, Highly Unsatisfactory.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

# Contents

Principal Ratings ..... v
Key Staff Responsible ..... v
Preface ..... vii
1. Background ..... 1
2. Objectives and Implementation of the Assessed Projects ..... 2
Fellowships Program ..... 4
Development of Secondary Education and Instructional Delivery ..... 4
Teacher Training and Replacement of Foreign Teachers ..... 6
School Management ..... 7
3. Ratings ..... 7
Outcomes ..... 8
Institutional Development Impact ..... 8
Sustainability ..... 8
Bank Performance ..... 8
Borrower Performance ..... 8
4. Issues for Future Consideration ..... 9
To Reduce Foreign Teachers, Maldivian Staff Must Be Used More Effectively ..... 9
Innovative Thinking Needed for Classroom Instruction ..... 10
Educational Research is Needed ..... 12
Lessons ..... 12
Annex A. Project Activities ..... 15
Table 2. Second Education and Training Project (Cr. 2701-MAL) ..... 16
Annex B. Basic Data Sheet ..... 19

**Tables**

Table 1. Project Objectives ..... 3
Table 2. Changes in Student Enrollments during Project Implementation ..... 5

This report was prepared by Helen Abadzi, who assessed the project in May 2002. The report was edited by William B. Hurlbut, and Pilar Barquero provided administrative support.

## Principal Ratings

| | ICR* | ES* | PPAR |
|---|---|---|---|
| ***Education and Training Project (Credit 1981-MAL)*** | | | |
| Outcome | Satisfactory | Satisfactory | Highly Satisfactory |
| Sustainability | Likely | Likely | Likely |
| Institutional Development | Substantial | Substantial | Substantial |
| Bank Performance | Satisfactory | Satisfactory | Satisfactory |
| Borrower Performance | Satisfactory | Satisfactory | Highly Satisfactory |
| ***Second Education and Training Project (Credit 2701-MAL)*** | | | |
| Outcome | Satisfactory | Satisfactory | Highly Satisfactory |
| Sustainability | Likely | Likely | Likely |
| Institutional Development | Substantial | Substantial | Substantial |
| Bank Performance | Satisfactory | Satisfactory | Satisfactory |
| Borrower Performance | Highly Satisfactory | Satisfactory | Highly Satisfactory |

* The Implementation Completion Report (ICR) is a self-evaluation by the responsible operational division of the Bank. The Evaluation Summary (ES) is an intermediate OED product that seeks to independently verify the findings of the ICR.

## Key Staff Responsible

| Project | Task Manager/Leader | Division Chief/ Sector Director | Country Director |
|---|---|---|---|
| ***Education and Training Project (Credit 1981-MAL)*** | | | |
| Appraisal | Ruth Montague | Christopher Gilpin | Marianne Haug |
| Completion | Albert Aimee | Barbara Herz | Mieko Nishimizu |
| ***Second Education and Training Project (Credit 2701-MAL)*** | | | |
| Appraisal | Albert Aimee | Barbara Herz | Paul Eisenman |
| Completion | Vincent Greaney | Emmanuel Jimenez | Fakhruddin Ahmed |

## Preface

This Project Performance Assessment Report (PPAR) covers the two completed education projects in the Maldives:

- ***Education and Training Project (Credit 1981–MAL)*** for US$8.19 million equivalent, which was approved in on January 26, 1989. The loan was completed on time and closed on December 31, 1995. An undisbursed balance of US$200,000 was cancelled.

- ***Second Education and Training Project (Credit 2701–MAL)*** for US$13.4 million equivalent, which was approved on April 11, 1995. The loan was completed on time, disbursed completely, and closed on June 30, 2000.

The assessments were conducted to study the effectiveness of Bank strategy in small countries that face unique economic and environmental challenges.

The PPAR is based on the following sources: Project or Implementation Completion Reports (ICRs), Staff Appraisal Reports (SARs), Credit Agreements for the projects, and project files, particularly the supervision reports. An OED mission visited Maldives in May-June 2002 to collect other pertinent information. The author thanks the government officials who received the mission for their extensive cooperation.

Following standard OED procedures, copies of the draft PPAR were sent to the relevant government officials and agencies for their review and comments but none were received.

# 1. Background

1.1 The Republic of Maldives is a chain of 1,192 low-lying islands in the Indian Ocean. Of these, 199 are inhabited by a population of 270,101 (in 2000). The Maldives faces development constraints typical of small island states. It has a small domestic market, a narrow and fragile resource base, a shortage of skilled personnel, difficult inter-island transport, and high unit costs of social and economic infrastructure provision. However, Maldives has extensive fishery resources and is an attractive tourist destination. In the past 20 years, the country has put its resources to good use; its gross domestic product has grown by about 8 percent annually since 1980, lifting the Maldives from being one of the 10 poorest countries in the 1970s to a lower middle-income country with a per capita income of about US$1,968. The economic growth has brought about access to basic social services and good health indicators, with a life expectancy of 72 years (in 1999). The adult illiteracy rate is only 1.06 percent (in 2000), compared to 16 percent for other lower-middle income countries.[1] This is partly attributed to the simple and precise Dhivehi script, which has been in extensive traditional use since the 12th century.

1.2 Because the Dhivehi language does not yet have the vocabulary to deal with many contemporary concepts, its use as a medium of instruction is limited to smaller schools in the more remote atolls, where teachers lack English-language education. Primary schools (grades 1-7) typically teach in English in Male' and in the more accessible atolls, with Dhivehi as a subject for local language and religion. (All primary school children learn 3 scripts in grade 1, including Arabic.) Primary education includes grades 1-7, while secondary includes 8-10. Secondary education is conducted in English, and a one-year catch-up course is provided for those who have studied in Dhivehi medium schools. The country follows the British system of O and A levels and examinations, and uses the Cambridge University syllabi. At the end of grade 10, students take the O level examinations. If they pass enough subjects to meet standards, they can enter the three higher secondary education schools in the country for grades 10-12. Also the Faculty (formerly Institute) of Teacher Education functions at the higher secondary education level, and students only need 10 years of education and two years of training to become primary school teachers.

1.3 The population places a priority on education, and parents show a great deal of interest in it. Thus, excellence and attainment of high educational levels is a government priority. The entire school system had about 103,391 students and 5,064 teachers in 2001. Primary education became universal in the 1980s, with the net enrollment ratio reaching 100 percent in 1998, with all girls attending primary school.[2] The number of students at that level doubled between 1993 and 1998. All education is free, and the best education is provided by government schools. Private schools are considered less desirable, though they are often subsidized. The islands also have schools built and supported by communities, which often lack the resources of Male's schools. All students own textbooks, which are necessary because of extensive homework. The poorer parents can apply and get them free.

---

1. Detailed data provided by Department of Statistics, Government of Maldives. Maldives at a Glance. Edstats. World Bank has similar figures. The per capita income is calculated by the Atlas method, 2001. However, documents such as the Country Assistance Evaluation (1999) indicate a per-capita income of about US$1200.

2. Maldives – Country Assistance Evaluation. 2001. World Bank: Operations Evaluation Department.



BEST COPY AVAILABLE

1.4 The country's objective is to provide secondary education (up to grade 10) for all students, but in the past, students had to come to the overcrowded Male' schools. Due to expense and difficulties in reaching secondary schools, enrollment at this level is only about 43 percent. Besides lack of infrastructure, the main limitation is the provision of trained secondary-level Maldivian teachers; there are only about 354 of them. The country relies heavily on foreign teachers, mainly from India and Sri Lanka, who constitute about 73 percent of approximately 1330 secondary-level teachers.[3] These cost twice as much as local teachers and have a high turnover rate. Thus, the government's priority has been to decrease dependence on foreign teachers by expanding higher secondary education (grades 11-12) and provision of tertiary-level teacher training.

1.5 Being small, the country has limited tertiary education and relies on scholarships for study abroad. The government functionaries of today have largely studied in the industrialized countries through such scholarships, but these cadres are few in comparison to the needs of the country. Traditionally, countries such as Australia, India, the Commonwealth, Egypt, and the Gulf states have given 10-20 scholarships each, but the numbers have gradually diminished. A systematic fellowships program was needed to provide training in various fields needed in the country.

1.6 *Other donor activities.* The Maldives receives donor aid from bilateral organizations, such as Japan, Australia, and the Gulf countries. UNDP also has a local office. During the appraisal of the Bank's first and second education projects, considerable donor coordination was carried out. The Australian International Development Assistance Bureau cofinanced US$1.2 million for teacher training activities for the second project, while the Islamic Development Bank financed the construction of a large atoll secondary school in the north. Japan has financed several primary schools, while UNDP has provided technical assistance support for studies. The Asian Development Bank through Ln. 1637-MD is supporting institutional development for the Center for Higher Secondary Education, and a follow-on project will support vocational-technical education. Government staff mentioned to the OED mission that the experience in implementing the Bank projects has been very useful in dealing with the procurement details of the ADB loans.

## 2. Objectives and Implementation of the Assessed Projects

2.1 The Maldives had borrowed from the Bank in the 1980s for infrastructure projects, such as fisheries and airport expansion. It decided to borrow for education from the World Bank only in 1993, at a time of rapid economic expansion and when it was evident that it did not have the resources to increase its human resources rapidly. The projects focused on the investments that were to fill the areas of highest need: expansion of secondary and post-secondary quality education. Due to the size of the country, different aspects of the sector were dealt with in one project. (See Table 1).

2.2 The first, second, and third projects (the latter currently under implementation) were designed to respond to macroeconomic and sectoral strategies. They complement each other in addressing sector needs, and have very similar components. For example, cost recovery was

3. Ministry of Education. Educational Statistics 2001. There are only about 427 students in grade 11 students and 397 in grade 12. Of the expatriate teachers, about 940 are at the secondary level and about 625 at the primary level. Most primary school teachers lack secondary education. About 2112 of them have received some training, but 289 others lack both secondary education and teacher training.

initiated in the first, institutionalized in the second, and implemented in the third project.[4] The projects are also dealing with the high dropout and repetition rates caused by controlled transition from primary to secondary schools and by the limited availability of secondary education.

**Table 1. Project Objectives**

| | *Quality* | *Physical Improvements-Financing* | *Management/ Capacity Building* |
|---|---|---|---|
| Education and Training Project (Cr. 1881-MAL) | Upgrade the quality of upper secondary education at the Science Education Center through the provision of 28 study years of fellowships, equipment, and learning materials. | Create secondary education opportunities in the atolls through the establishment of a regional secondary school. | Finance a national scholarship program of about 171 study-years of overseas fellowships for higher-level training.<br>Finance fellowships and experts to strengthen the planning capacity of the Ministry of Education, improve labor market information, and undertake teacher issues studies. |
| Second Education and Training Project (Cr. 2701-MAL) | Improve primary and secondary education quality, targeting opportunities for the poor, and providing better access in the atolls.<br>Upgrade atoll primary teachers. | Reduce the shortage of teachers.<br>Focus on greater female participation.<br>Reduce skill shortages. | Upgrade staff at the health, vocational, management and teacher training institutions.<br>Increase fellowship training opportunities by allocating training to both public and private sector recipients<br>Strengthen financial management of the education sector. |
| Third Education and Training Project (Cr. 3325-MAL)<br>Effective 12/30/00; closing 3/31/05 | Improve education quality. | Increase equitable access. | Raise professional skills levels of the national labor force.<br>Strengthen institutional capacity. |

2.3 A project implementation unit was established at the Ministry of Human Resources, Employment, and Labour. A project director was hired who insisted on high standards. Project staff were dynamic, qualified and dedicated, and continuity was maintained over the years. Initially, expatriate implementation and procurement advisors were used, and staff learned from them. Thus, the projects started their activities quickly, disbursed rapidly, and closed within the expected time. The third project (Cr. 3325-MAL ) became effective on June 30, 2000, and is expected to be completed on March 31, 2005.

2.4 Implementation problems were relatively few. Widely dispersed atolls made field-based supervision difficult. Fellowship recipients had difficulty getting admissions to regional universities due to language problems and relatively low academic achievement. A company that was to build a management information system went bankrupt, and this activity was not completed. Coral reefs were used for some school construction in the atolls (as was done traditionally), but they are endangered, and the Bank has received assurances that coral will not be used in the future. Overall, the experience has been very satisfactory for both the Bank and the government. Almost all targets were met or exceeded (Annex A Table 1 and Annex 1 Table 2).

4. Maldives. Third Eduation and Training Project. Sector and Project Economic Analysis. World Bank: February 2000.

2.5 **Mission visits.** The mission visited 12 primary and secondary schools, the Male' and southern higher secondary school, the Faculty of Education, and the Center for Higher Secondary Education. Schools were chosen on an informal random basis and for ease of access (e.g., hours of operation at a time that the mission could visit). Three schools were visited in Male', one in Villingili island, and eight in the Hitadhoo atoll. The mission also held meetings with groups of staff at the Ministry of Human Resources, Employment, and Labour, the Center of Higher Education, higher secondary schools of Male' and Hitadhoo, and other schools visited. Discussions with officials and field visits produced the following observations.

## Fellowships Program

2.6 The two projects together awarded fellowships to about 561 people in the public and private sectors to study fields needed by the government. A 15 percent cost recovery was expected from public-sector employees, which students were willing to pay, and most are doing so in installments. These fellowships included graduate studies in sciences and arts but also health, aviation, and fire safety specializations. A program of this magnitude is rarely carried out in other countries. *About 85 percent of the trainees completed their degrees and almost all returned.* (Returns were voluntary.) In the southern atoll, the mission encountered four administrators who had studied through various scholarship schemes and returned to schools. An impact evaluation was carried out of the fellowship program under the second project. The fellowships were found to benefit significantly the Maldives College of Higher Education, whose staff received advanced degrees. The study concluded that academically stronger candidates should be chosen to improve success rates, that needs for various specialties should be enunciated more clearly, and that the government should ask all candidates to pay their contribution to the costs.[5] The government implemented many of the recommendations. Given the pressure that many officials were subjected to as a result of the close relationships among the country's citizens, a council was established to review applications anonymously on the basis of clear criteria, and announcements were made by radio to inform the population of the fellowships. The various ministries are now asked to prioritize their needs for scholarships. To deal specifically with the need to train secondary-level teachers, the follow-on project has set aside 48 fellowships for masters' degrees in education.

2.7 *How did overseas training improve job performance?* The impact evaluation study (undertaken during the follow-on third project) was unable to gather hard data on the performance of the trained employees, but interviews indicated that trainees felt more capable in their technical duties. The OED mission also interviewed about 14 persons who had received various scholarships. Most found the question hard to answer. They felt they had increased self-confidence, better knowledge of the subject matter, and ability to bring about changes in some procedures carried out in various jobs.

## Development of Secondary Education and Instructional Delivery

2.8 The projects built six secondary schools for 1,400 students in atolls, which resulted in a 15 percent increase of student enrollments outside Male'. With the various donor investments, atolls now have about 16,000 students in grades 8-10, and numbers have been steadily increasing (Table 2).[6] Women have benefited from the investments and constitute 52 percent of secondary

---

5. Ministry of Human Resources, Employment, and Labour. Impact of the Overseas Scholarship Program Funded by the Second Education and Training Project March 2002.

6. The population growth has been a high 2.8%, which should result in a doubling of the population within 25 years (Allak, M. Maldives: Third Education and Training Project. Sector and Project Economic Analyses, World Bank 2000,

students. (Perhaps more teenage boys get jobs.) Nevertheless, there are questions raised regarding the ability of more girls to go to secondary schools from the more remote atolls. There are no dormitories, partly because traditionally families of friends or relatives take children in exchange for housework. Also, families are reluctant to send girls away from home unsupervised. Children from islands often get scholarship money for their everyday needs in island schools. The government has similarly been reluctant to open dormitories, and some officials cited a previous negative experience. However, two officials felt that dormitories, if managed well, could be effective in attracting girls to secondary schools and thus possibly alleviating the need for local, trained teachers at that level.

**Table 2. Changes in Student Enrollments during Project Implementation**

| Student Enrollment | 1998 | 1999 | 2000 | 2001 |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Preprimary | 11,508 | 12,031 | 12,894 | 12,809 |
| Primary | 73,519 | 74,050 | 73,522 | 71,054 |
| Secondary (Grades 8-10) | 11,845 | 14,531 | 18,254 | 21,644 |
| Male' (Grades 8-10) | 7,337 | 8,033 | 9,018 | 9,551 |
| Atolls (Grades 8-10) | 4,508 | 6,498 | 9,236 | 12,093 |
| Higher Secondary (Grades 11-12) | 436 | 457 | 638 | 824 |

Source: Ministry of Education, 2002

2.9 The mission visited and briefly studied the activities of about 40 classes, primary and secondary. Principals reported that teacher absenteeism is negligible, and school time is used productively. All classes were English-medium, which is becoming the norm even in atoll primary schools. Most were engaged in learning tasks, though 8 classes were unoccupied at the moment of mission entry. In all engaged classes, the students were sitting and writing, while the teacher was standing and lecturing. In the higher primary and secondary grades no textbooks were in sight; students copied from the board and took notes about the lecture. Although seating arrangements often made it possible, no group work or other activities were observed. One class only (in a primary school) was observed doing group work. The educational goal is that by the end of the first grade, all students should be able to read in English and Dhivehi. The achievement of this goal is not yet certain; however, all students who were randomly asked by the mission to read could do so in English and in Dhivehi. The only major obstacle identified in some atoll schools was multiple classrooms without separating walls, which created a high noise level and distracted the children.

2.10 The higher secondary school in the Hitadhoo atoll was found to be impeccably maintained, and classes were very orderly and disciplined. Almost all classes were engaged in learning tasks when the mission entered, with students studying various aspects of the Cambridge syllabus. It was surprising, therefore, to see students studying about the London underground trains, labor union negotiations, and calculations in British pounds. Even the locally prepared fisheries course was delivered in English; there were few names of Maldivian marine life and no practicums in the sea, located a few meters away from the students. Thus, parts of the curriculum seemed completely unrelated to the needs of students in remote atolls, where there is much

---

p. 17). However, according to the government, the rate of increase is slowing down. Primary-level school populations have been dropping as a result of family size decreases, but secondary-school populations are expected to rise for several years due to pent-up demand before leveling off. Preschool populations are still rising as a result of population increase and greater coverage.

employment in tourism.[7] Staff explained that it is important for the Maldives to have internationally recognized examinations to enable its students to get admission to good universities. However, teachers and principals expressed the idea that there should be national examinations and greater curricular freedom.

### Teacher Training and Replacement of Foreign Teachers

2.11 Because there are insufficient teachers with suitable training at all educational levels, both projects emphasized the provision of in-service and pre-service teacher training through buildings, fellowships, and materials for the Faculty of Teacher Education and the faculty of Education in the Maldives College for Higher Education. The former institution, which has opened branches in some atolls, trains grade 10 graduates to become teachers through a two-year program, and the latter trains grade 12 leavers to become secondary-level teachers. The in-service teacher education is targeted toward untrained teachers and those with only grade 7 education, who constitute the majority of the teachers in the atolls. To deal with the more remote areas, a distance education program has begun. Curricula are developed through international benchmarking, which involves studying the curricula in industrialized countries, developing curricula according to their needs, and then asking two experts to evaluate them.

2.12 Primary education teacher training has considerable demand, since few grade 10 leavers are admitted to grade 11, and most students cannot study abroad; 1,000 students, mostly women apply, and 200 are selected.[8] Also, training for the certification of untrained teachers is being taken seriously. The mission visited the Faculty of Teacher Education branch in Hitadhoo and found about 20 untrained teachers taking a two-year evening course. The building was well maintained and provided with materials. The teachers had been educated through fellowships, knew the subject matter, and taught from up-to-date international textbooks. As a result of these efforts, the need for expatriate teachers at the primary level has been minimized to about 625. However, there is much less supply of students for secondary education teaching, where the bulk of expatriate teachers are. The Faculty of Education visited the Hitadhoo atoll and tried to attract students' attention, but got a limited response. Similarly, discussions with students and teachers in Hitadhoo raised doubts regarding the probability that graduates will become secondary education teachers. The boys get well-paid jobs in resorts, and the girls have begun to do so as well. The students of grades 11-12 are a highly selected group that aspires to study abroad through the next rounds of fellowships. Overall, these students have better career prospects than teaching.

2.13 *How does teacher training influence teaching performance?* Primary education trainers at the Faculty of Education praised the trainees' motivation and indicated that in terms of subject matter mastery, the teachers are improving significantly. In terms of teaching methodology, however, it was unclear how teacher behaviors have improved. Some indicated that trained teachers have self-confidence, speak up in meetings, are eager to apply what they have learned, and overall "know what to do." During training, teachers are urged to teach through varied and more active methods, including assignment of projects that synthesize knowledge. However, when they are assigned to schools, they find that they must abandon these activities. There is English language to teach and the Cambridge syllabus to deliver, and classes must be standardized to meet parents' expectations that all students will learn as much as possible. Thus, the class time mainly consists of "chalk and talk." As a result, the teaching aids and materials for which large amounts have been spent are not frequently used. The trainers stated that they fight

7. The serving of alcohol to tourists, however, creates some cultural reluctance to work in the resorts.

8. It is unclear how many graduates actually become teachers and how many use this training as general education.

against the repetitive information-only instruction and lack of reflective thinking, but content coverage has a higher priority. The more cognitively based methods leave few paper traces, and may not satisfy parents.

2.14 The pressure on teachers to deliver the material rather than make it more memorable also comes from the long hours they must work. In addition to the academic work, they must organize many extracurricular activities, such as singing, Quran recitation, and netball competitions. Male' schools, in particular, are rated by parents on the basis of victories in these competitions. Also, homework must be graded for about three hours per week. Though teachers teach 25-30 hours a week, they work at least 40 and may still have no time to prepare lessons for classes. Many foreign teachers found their earnings of about US$500 per month satisfactory, but some local teachers expressed the view that their pay is too low for the amount of work they must do.

### School Management

2.15 The mission observed schools with relatively large numbers of high-level non-teaching staff. Most Maldivian schools (of 300-1,000 students) have a principal, an assistant principal, a headmaster, and supervisors (one for each grade in Male' and one for every 2-3 grades in the atolls). Many of these staff have obtained fellowships and are highly educated. Their duties are unclear; supervisors said they support the teachers and deal with discipline cases, but discipline problems are not reported as severe. Almost all non-teaching staff in secondary schools were Maldivian, whereas most teachers were foreigners. (The Maldivian teachers mainly teach religion and Dhivehi.) Maldivian teachers who obtain advanced training may become supervisors or managers, leaving the classrooms to foreign teachers. Certainly, the government prefers to have nationals as administrators. However, *a pattern has developed whereby training and fellowships do not necessarily result in more trained secondary teachers for the country.*

2.16 Because the educational management information system is not yet well developed,[9] it is unclear how many supervisors and administrators exist and how their numbers have changed during the last decade relative to teacher numbers. Closer inspection might show redundancy. There may be prospects for savings if some management-level staff return to teaching. It would be useful, therefore, to chart the increase in the numbers of administrative staff and examine the justification for their existence.

## 3. Ratings

3.1 The Bank's human resource development strategy for the Maldives has been relevant to the country's economic needs, and the objectives of the projects have been relevant to the sectoral objectives of the government. At often happens with small countries, the rather small IDA credits had a substantial impact in improving educational outcomes.[10] Overall, the staff consulted had very positive opinions regarding the effectiveness of the Bank financing.

---

9. MIS is an important component of the third project.

10. Bray, Mark and Steve Packer, 1993, Education in Small States: Concepts, Challenges, and Strategies. Oxford: Pergamon Press, p. 97.

**Outcomes**

3.2 OED rates projects on the basis of relevance, efficacy, and efficiency. These criteria were substantially met. The projects met or exceeded almost all their objectives and subobjectives (Annex A, Tables 1 and 2). The government met its goal to achieve universal basic education to grade 7 by 2000. Students are increasingly able to attend secondary school in the atolls near their homes rather than Male'; the proportion of student enrollment in Male' has declined from 80% to 55% of the country's students, and there is less demand for the overcrowded Male' accommodations. Teacher training facilities in the atolls were built and remodeled, and the proportion of untrained primary-school teachers has dropped from 40 percent to 10 percent. The fellowships increased the pool of trained workers in all areas, from fire safety to accounting. Local higher education was strengthened and can train human resources further. The government followed up and implemented many study recommendations. Though a management information system for educational and labor data could not be developed to the extent expected, a great deal was achieved. Overall, outcomes for both projects are rated **highly satisfactory.**

**Institutional Development Impact**

3.3 The effect of the fellowships and training of trainers on the government system in general and the schools in particular has been profound and widely acknowledged. Lack of specific information on labor needs and the changing educational needs has prevented to some extent very specific planning actions. However, the impact of these projects on the institutions of the country is rated **substantial.**

**Sustainability**

3.4 The sustainability of both projects is rated **likely**. Recurrent expenditure budgets are available to maintain the buildings, and training initiatives. The second and third projects have institutionalized partial cost recovery from fellowships, and proceeds will finance future fellowship programs.

**Bank Performance**

3.5 Overall, Bank performance is rated **satisfactory**. There was task manager continuity and considerable Bank appreciation of the government's efforts. The budget allocated to supervision was small (about US$30,000 for FY99), and partly due to distance, projects were not supervised as often as they might have been However, the good relationship established with the government of the Maldives made it possible to communicate from a distance and to resolve promptly any procurement and implementation issues. The government expressed appreciation of the Bank's help in the sector, and a Quality Assurance Group (QAG) review in September 2000 rated supervision quality as highly satisfactory.

**Borrower Performance**

3.6 The government showed much commitment and readiness to implement. Staff continuity and attentiveness to various issues ensured that work was carried out promptly and efficiently. Overall, borrower performance is rated **highly satisfactory**.

## 4. Issues for Future Consideration

### To Reduce Foreign Teachers, Maldivian Staff Must Be Used More Effectively

4.1 The Bank projects have removed many systemic obstacles to training teachers at the primary and secondary levels, but the proportion of foreign secondary teachers remains at 75 percent, as it was before the second project. The number of new Maldivian teachers barely covers the rising demand for secondary education. The wider the access to secondary education, the higher the demands for rather specialized teachers. It is possible that teaching is not a desirable profession for many and that the number of people who really like it is much smaller than the number of teachers needed.

4.2 A new strategy is needed to raise the supply of people willing to become secondary school teachers. Some options and issues are:

- *Salaries could increase.* Current teacher salaries and supplements amount to about Rf 4,000 per month (US$314), a rate that corresponds to about 3.5 times the per capita GDP. International experience shows that this is the minimum salary level for a sustainable teacher corps, and secondary teachers may require more. Foreign teachers, who often only stay for a few years, earn almost double, and much money is spent on recruiting them and paying for their tickets. One strategy might be to pay local secondary-level teachers salaries approximating those of foreign teachers. Another is to give salary supplements to relatively qualified people willing to work in the atolls. The question is whether the country values more the lower wage bill or a national and more stable teacher corps.

- *Distance education could be extended.* Since A level graduates have little interest in secondary-level teaching, a program has been instituted to train O level graduates. For the past three years, 20-30 students have been trained in Male', but the numbers are small, and their academic knowledge was found to be low. A one-year foundation course has been instituted to deal with these deficiencies. The program could be expanded and also delivered through teacher training centers based in atolls as well as through correspondence and computer-based training. (Computers are now widely available in the atolls.) Also the academic requirements may be reconsidered, particularly in light of the high failure rates in some O and A level examinations. People learn a lot by teaching the material; since Maldivian schools have many administrators and supervisors, it may be possible to give extra support to these less qualified teachers until they learn well the material they teach.

- *Somewhat older female students could be recruited.* Efforts thus far have focused on the present school cohorts. However, the atolls have women in their 20s and 30s who obtained O levels several years ago. Efforts could be made to recruit and train this more mature population for secondary school teaching. Also, primary school teachers could be retrained.

- *Supervisors and administrators could be reallocated to classrooms.* Maldivian teachers often go into supervision and administration, leaving actual teaching to foreigners. According to mission observations, perhaps two to four staff in each school could be reallocated to teaching duties. Surely there will be much effort to justify the non-teaching duties and pressure to remain outside the classroom.

However, the government must determine whether its priorities are in replacing foreign teachers or providing high levels of support to teachers.

- *Teacher extracurricular loads could be reduced.* The social desirability of extracurricular activities coupled with various administrative duties may be overloading teachers and driving away from teaching those who can find higher paying jobs with less work. Parents (some of whom are stay-at-home women) are already involved in schools to some extent; their involvement with social events could increase, and thus they could alleviate teacher extracurricular loads.

- *Willing teachers could be trained to teach subjects they have not passed at O level.* An important disadvantage of the British O and A level system is the early specialization and the small number of subjects studied. After grade 7, students may not see again any mathematics, chemistry, or physics. This system, which is contrary to international trends toward later specialization, also creates obstacles in finding qualified teachers for sciences. The government might consider retraining willing staff, regardless of their pass levels.

- *The number of part-time teachers could increase.* At this time, part-time teaching is mainly confined to religion courses.

4.3 The government is greatly concerned about these issues and actively looking for alternatives. Hopefully it will balance the pros and cons of various alternatives to the country's greatest benefit.

## Innovative Thinking Needed for Classroom Instruction

4.4 The pressure of teaching the material through English in primary schools and of delivering the Cambridge syllabus in secondary schools leaves little flexibility for instructional methods that engage students in group work and in synthetic and analytic activities. Thus, teachers must leave aside techniques that may help process information more efficiently but are time consuming. For example, all sections of the same grade must teach the same material (e.g., parts of a tree) at the same time, and teachers have little latitude in presenting the material.

4.5 The choices that the government has made create some dilemmas:

- Primary school children taught basic skills in English (particularly in the atolls where exposure to the language is only limited to school) may repeat material fluently, but research in other countries suggest that their comprehension of various concepts may be more limited than is thought.[11] Children may be better

---

11. e.g., H. Patrinos and E. Velez. 1996. Costs and Benefits of Bilingual Education in Guatemala, Human Capital Development Working Papers 74, Washington, D.C.: World Bank.

Dutcher, N. & Tucker, R. (1997) The Use of First and Second Languages in Education: A Review of International Experience. The Pacific Islands Discussion Paper Series (World Bank Report Number 18803). Washington, D.C.: World Bank Group.
Findings from a 1998 study may be applicable to the problems faced in countries such as Francophone Africa. (Wayne P. Thomas and Virginia Collier. 1997. School Effectiveness for Language Minority Students (http://www.ncbe.gwu.edu). Through a US government grant, the authors studied the longitudinal performance of minority-language students in various types of bilingual programs, including the performance of students studying exclusively in English because of parental choice. They found a distinct advantage to mother-tongue instruction in earlier years and teaching courses in both languages in later years.

off learning basic concepts (e.g., social studies and science) in Dhivehi while studying English as a second language. A change of language code in mathematical calculations may slow students down needlessly. However, there is a high social demand for English as a medium of instruction.

- Secondary-school students must pass external examinations on issues they are completely unfamiliar with, such as those involved in the British social studies and environment. After grade 7, little knowledge is imparted about the Maldives or the South Asia region. The generally accepted principle that curricula should be relevant to the needs of a country is being sacrificed for unquestionable international acceptability when applying for fellowships.

4.6 Rather than continue with the Cambridge examination, the government may consider alternatives, such as:

- *The International Baccalaureate*. This curriculum, which is implemented in many schools and parts of the world, is more flexible and than a British curriculum and allows for cultural sensitivity and country-oriented studies. This diploma is accepted by the vast majority of higher education institutions worldwide.[12]

- *A Maldivian examination*. The government hesitates to undertake this alternative because of concerns that nationally awarded diplomas may not be considered equivalent by overseas universities. However, the government can make arrangements with universities to accept their degrees; there is a worldwide system of university-level transcript evaluations, and information about the Maldivian system must be updated. For example, the Caribbean Examinations Council gradually abolished British examinations, successfully implemented a locally developed examination with technical assistance, and ensured international recognition of its diplomas.

4.7 By selecting the fellowship recipients and future leaders of the country on the basis of the Cambridge examination, the government selects persons who can perform well in reproducing material from irrelevant curricula and a language of limited comprehension. It is unknown how closely this type of performance is linked to leadership ability. Perhaps the system thus selects people who can suspend their judgment and perform unquestionably. Thus, compliant students may not necessarily be the best future government functionaries and decisionmakers. The government might study the human resources produced and determine how best to reward and stimulate judgment and creativity for its staff. For example, scholarships might be awarded not only on the basis of high academic performance but also on the basis of extracurricular activities or publications that indicate leadership potential.

4.8 The government might also *benefit from study tours*, particularly in countries like Chile, that use classroom time on task well, while keeping instruction relevant and efficient. In that country, parental involvement is institutionalized and very extensive, a model that the government of the Maldives might find useful.

12. Information is available at www.ibo.org. The organization has curricula for primary, middle, and secondary years. It originated in Switzerland and is administered in Cardiff, United Kingdom.

**Educational Research is Needed**

4.9 The issues outlined above are particular to the Maldives, and merit research. The Faculty of Education staff could carry out studies to inform the government on the best ways to train students most efficiently. Some issues to study might be:

- What is the cognitive effect of copying and taking notes in various grades? Are students more likely to remember material if they listen to it and discuss it or if they write it down?

- How well do children understand science and social science concepts taught in English and Dhivehi in various grades? Do children show more understanding, application, analysis, and synthesis of concepts if they are taught in Dhivehi? How does a change in the language affect the speed and efficiency of mathematical calculations?

- What are the pros and cons as well as logistics of grouping in classrooms where a great deal of material must be mastered quickly?

- How distracting is noise in community schools that have low or no walls separating classrooms? Controlling for other variables, how well do students perform in classrooms with and without walls?

4.10 The Faculty of Education has no direct incentive or money to do this work. Perhaps the ongoing projects of the ADB and World Bank (which has curriculum and technical assistance components) could finance needed research.

**Lessons**

4.11 Experience with the projects confirms a number of OED lessons from education projects:

- Government commitment is critical for success. This lesson has been repeated often, yet this commitment has been particularly important for the success of these projects.

- In small countries, projects that have components involving multiple ministries. These can be successfully implemented when there is a strong stakeholder commitment to reform and when there is political and administrative commitment to setting and achieving high-quality standards.

- Extensive and functional supervision at the school level may significantly promote high achievement. (The Malidivian improvement in achievement may also be related to school-level supervisors.) However, school-based supervision may result in taking good staff out of the classroom.

- An increase in the supply of teachers is not automatically related to the provision of suitable education. The social and economic challenges of the profession make it attractive to fewer people than countries often need. Suitable incentives are needed to create a pool of qualified and effective teachers.

- Small countries face challenges in creating tertiary-level training human resources. Fellowship programs need components of cost recovery, clear prioritizing of local needs,

and clear selection criteria to raise the population's confidence level regarding the impartiality of selections.

- Training abroad as opposed to running costly and inefficient small national institutions (as done by most of the Pacific countries) may be a more economical and efficient means to reduce key skill shortages.

# Annex A. Project Activities

## Table 1. Education and Training Project (Credit 1981-MAL)

| *Components/ subcomponents* | *Activities* | *Targets to be achieved* | *Outputs* | *Outcomes* |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| National Scholarships Program | Overseas fellowships for higher level training | 171 study years | 284 fellowships<br>247% of the target<br>5 for higher secondary education | All trainees returned by 3/1996, received government positions<br>Post-sec graduates in the country increased by 200% |
| Upgrade upper secondary education quality at the Science Education Center | Fellowships | 28 study years | 28 study years | National teachers increased from 10 to 20<br>GCE pass rates increased from 50% to 70% |
| | Equipment and learning materials | Laboratory equipment, books | Supplied | Quality of instruction improved (above) |
| Create secondary education opportunities in the atolls | Construction of a regional secondary school in Hitadhoo | 1 secondary school for 440 students | Constructed<br>448 students enrolled<br>60% female | Equity for southern students increased |
| Strengthen the planning capacity of the Ministry of Education | Finance fellowships | 2 planning officers | 2 planning officers<br>progress in data analysis, publication of statistics | Trained staff assumed positions in the Ministry, promoted<br>Planning capacity marginally increased |
| | Improve labor market information | | | Deferred to the third project |
| | Expatriate advisors for planning, project implementation | 4, 3, 2 months annually | Advisors effective in dealing with procurement and implementation details | Project procured and disbursed according to schedule |
| | Fellowships to assist project implementation | | | Trained staff assumed positions in the PIU |
| | Teacher issues studies | | Completed<br>National review of teacher demand and supply | Development of more responsive teaching strategy<br>Teacher training and deployment policy changes |
| | Labor study | | Key shortages identified | Findings used to fine-tune fellowship program |

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

**Table 2. Second Education and Training Project (Cr. 2701-MAL)**

| *Components/ subcomponents* | *Activities* | *Targets to be achieved* | *Outputs* | *Outcomes* |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Teacher training<br>Strengthen pre- and in-service primary teacher training programs | Establish an in-country lower secondary teacher training program | | Program successfully established | Teachers trained according to expected standards |
| | Improve access to secondary education in the atolls through building, equipping and staffing five lower secondary schools in the atolls; | 5 secondary schools<br>increase of 1400 students in the atolls | Students increased by 1708<br>About 3925 students in the atolls<br>Girls' enrollment increased by 1798, by 19.3%<br>Boys' increase by 17%<br>53% of atoll students are female | Secondary education has become much more prevalent in the atolls |
| Implement a staff development plan | Strengthen preservice training | | | |
| | Upgrade atoll for primary and lower secondary school teachers | 40% atoll teachers untrained, most trained had only primary educabon | Untrained teachers reduced to 10%<br>Inservice<br>2410 primary teachers<br>30 Dhivehi medium teachers<br>Preservice certificates for 811 males 1168 females | Teacher effectiveness increased |
| | Program for lower secondary teachers | National diploma in teaching | O level students accepted were 14-22 in 1997-2000 | Number small still, entrance quality low;<br>Expected to improve |
| Develop in-country fee-paying skill training programs accessible to both public and private trainees, and support staff development in health, vocational and management education; | Reduce skills shortages through fee paying courses at the Maldives Center for Management and Administration<br>Faculty of Teacher Education<br>Institute of Health Services<br>Vocational Training Center | Construction of the Maldives Center for Management and administration. | The center trained 1313 persons in 1996-2000;<br>939 after center developed<br>43% from public sector<br>467 students received training accounting, administration, secretarial skills, information technology. | Strengthening the center was highly significant in the human resource development of the country |
| Overseas fellowship training for qualified Maldivians to fill critical skills gaps in the public sector and provide trained staff for private sector labor market | Select the best candidates<br>Reduce skills shortages<br>Fellowships scheme reconceptualized | 25% allocated for private sector<br>80% of fellowships offered at lower-cost regional institutions<br>90 fellowships | 277 fellowships awarded<br>142 for government<br>67 for private sector<br>68 for specialized training<br>6% failed | Targeted training for secondary education teachers<br>Almost all returned |



BEST COPY AVAILABLE

| *Components/ subcomponents* | *Activities* | *Targets to be achieved* | *Outputs* | *Outcomes* |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| requirements | | | | |
| Establish more effective financial procedures and assist with management and policy support in the education sector | Improve financial practices and mechanisms<br>Develop a unit cost formula<br>Establish monitoring and tracking spending<br>Strengthen budgetary process | | Did not improve on these targets<br>They ran out of money for MIS | Doing in third project MIS<br>Now they don't have real-time data<br>3rd project is continuing |
| Policies | Recover cost of secondary education | | | Policy not yet implemented |
| | Raising student-teacher ratio | From 21-24 to 25 | Ratio about 21 | Ratio has proved hard to raise |
| | Decrease dependency on expatriates | 75% expatriates | Was at 74% | Could not be reduced, low local teacher supply |
| Studies | Public examinations system | | | Completed, well received |
| | Post-secondary education | | | Completed, well received |



BEST COPY AVAILABLE

# Annex B. Basic Data Sheet

## EDUCATION AND TRAINING PROJECT (CREDIT 1981)

### Key Project Data *(amounts in US$ million)*

| | Appraisal estimate | Actual or Current estimate | Actual as % of appraisal estimate |
|---|---|---|---|
| Total project costs | 9.34 | 8.42 | 90.1 |
| Loan amount | 8.19 | | |
| Cancellation | | 287.9 | |
| Date physical completion: | | | |

### Cumulative Estimated and Actual Disbursements *(US$ thousands)*

| | FY89 | Fy90 | Fy91 | Fy92 | Fy93 | Fy94 | Fy95 | Fy96 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Appraisal estimate | 100 | 650 | 2,340 | 4,070 | 5,600 | 6,840 | 7,790 | 8,190 |
| Actual | 0 | 690 | 1,550 | 4,020 | 5,730 | 6,820 | 7,580 | 8,121 |
| Actual as % of appraisal | 0 | 106 | 66 | 99 | 102 | 100 | 97 | 99 |
| Date of final disbursement: November 1995 | | | | | | | | |

### Project Dates

| | Original | Actual |
|---|---|---|
| Identification | | March 24, 1987 |
| Preparation | September 1, 1987 | May 2, 1987 |
| Appraisal | March 1, 1988 | May 18, 1988 |
| Negotiations | September 1, 1988 | December 5, 1988 |
| Board presentation | November 24, 1988 | January 26, 1989 |
| Signing | | March 23, 1989 |
| Effectiveness | | June 20, 1989 |
| Project completion | June 30, 1995 | June 30, 1995 |
| Loan closing | December 31, 1995 | December 31, 1995 |

### Staff Inputs (staff weeks)

| Stage of Project Cycle | Planned | | Revised | | Actual | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | Weeks | US$000 | Weeks | US$000 | Weeks | US$000 |
| Through appraisal | 63.0 | 147.1 | 63.0 | 147.1 | 63.0 | 147.1 |
| Appraisal Board | 15.0 | 42.0 | 13.0 | 36.4 | 12.7 | 35.4 |
| Board effectiveness | 4.0 | 12.8 | 4.0 | 12.8 | 1.8 | 3.8 |
| Supervision | 49.0 | 164.5 | 38.3 | 125.6 | 37.6 | 123.1 |
| Completion | 3.0 | 8.5 | 2.0 | 7.0 | 1.6 | 6.0 |
| Total | 134.0 | 374.9 | 120.3 | 328.9 | 116.7 | 315.4* |

*Note low cost of this operation.



BEST COPY AVAILABLE

## Mission Data

| | Date (month/year) | No. of persons | Staff days in field | Specializations represented | Performance rating: Implementation Status | Performance rating: Development Objectives | Types of problems |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Identification | March 1987 | 1 | 8 | Educator | | | |
| Preappraisal | Feb. 1988 | 4 | 22 | Economist Tech/Voc. Ed. Gen. Educator Architect | | | |
| Appraisal | May 1988 | 2 | 15 | Economist Architect | | | |
| Postappraisal | July 1988 | 1 | 3 | Ed. Specialist | | | |
| Start-up | March 1989 | 1 | 3 | Architect | | | |
| Supervision I | Sep-Oct. 89 | 1 | 4 | Architect | 1 | 1 | CW Contract |
| Supervision II | July 90 | 1 | 4 | Architect | 1 | 1 | None |
| Supervision III | Feb. 91 | 1 | 7 | Architect | 1 | 1 | None |
| Supervision IV | Dec. 91 | 1 | 4 | Ed. Specialist | 1 | 1 | None |
| Supervision V | Jul-Aug. 92 | 2 | 9 | Sr. Ed. Planner Architect | 1 | 1 | None |
| Supervision VI[a] | Aug. 93 | 3 | 6 | Sr. Ed. Planner Architect | 1 | 1 | None |
| Supervision VII | Feb. 94 | 2 | 2 | Sr. Ed. Planner Architect | 1 | 1 | None |
| Supervision VIII[a] | May-Jun. 94 | 2 | 8 | Sr. Ed. Planner Architect | HS | HS | None |
| Supervision IX[a] | Oct. 94 | 1 | 3 | Sr. Ed. Planner | HS | HS | None |
| Supervision X | Jan-Feb. 95 | 1 | 2 | Sr. Ed. Planner | HS | HS | None |
| Supervision XI | Oct. 95 | 1 | 5 | Sr. Ed. Planner | HS | HS | None |

According to FEPS, there was a preparation mission in July 1987, but TOR and BTO—on a preparation mission could not be located in the files.

a. Mission was combined with new lending operation with limited time given to supervision of the on-going project.

## Other Project Data

Borrower/Executing Agency:

*FOLLOW-ON OPERATIONS*

*STUDIES INCLUDED IN PROJECT*

| Study | Purpose as defined at appraisal | Status | Impact of Study |
|---|---|---|---|
| Labor Strategy and Survey of Skill Availability and Shortages in the Labor Market | Draw together results of various studies and produce a strategy and plan of action for Government to deal with issues, such as employment conditions, wages, labor migration, etc. | Completed in 1993. Dissemination and follow-up still needed. | Updated the census, identified skill needs for each ministry, established annual survey to maintain up-to-date information which would aid in prioritizing the country's training needs. |
| Teacher Deployment | Provide a strategy and plan of action which would guide the Government in allocating resources efficiently to recruit, train and deploy teachers at all levels equitable throughout the country. | Study submitted to Government on July 14, 1993. Some of the key recommendations are being implemented. | Strengthened primary education pre and in-service programs and introduced in-country junior secondary teacher training. |

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

## SECOND EDUCATION AND TRAINING PROJECT (CREDIT 2701)

### Key Project Data *(amounts in US$ million)*

| | Appraisal estimate | Actual or Current estimate | Actual as % of appraisal estimate |
|---|---|---|---|
| Total project costs | 17.90 | 17.31 | 97 |
| Loan amount | 13.4 | 12.88 | |
| Cofinancing | | | |
| Cancellation | | 0 | |
| Date physical completion: | | | |

### Project Dates

| | Original | Actual |
|---|---|---|
| Board approval | | April 11, 1995 |
| Signing | | May 1, 1995 |
| Effectiveness | | May 24, 1995 |
| Closing data | June 30, 2000 | June 30, 2000 |

### Staff Inputs (staff weeks)

| | Actual/Latest Estimate | |
|---|---|---|
| | N° Staff Weeks | US$ ('000) |
| Identification/Preparation | 51.9 | 167.2 |
| Appraisal/Negotiation | 13.5 | 64.3 |
| Supervision | 32.5 | 225.4 |
| ICR | 9.02 | 42.0 |
| Total | 106.92 | 498.9 |

### Mission Data

| | Date (month/year) | No. of persons | Specializations represented | Performing Rating | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | Implementation progress | Development objectives |
| Identification/ Preparation | 05/11/94 | 1 | EP | | |
| | | 1 | ES | | |
| | | 1 | EC | | |
| Appraisal/Negotiation | 06/04/94-06/18/94 | 1 | EP | | |
| | 10/10/94-10/20/94 | 1 | ES | | |
| | 01/14/95 | 1 | AR | | |
| | | 1 | LA | | |
| | | 1 | EC | | |
| | | 1 | SA | | |
| Supervisions | 05/12/95 | 1 | EP | HS | HS |
| | 10/23/95-10/29/95 | 1 | EP | HS | HS |
| | 03/01/96-03/02/96 | 1 | Director | S | HS |
| | 03/16/96-03/21/96 | 1 | | S | HS |
| | 08/11/96-08/15/96 | 1 | | S | HS |
| | 11/01/96-11/14/96 | 1 | EP, EC | S | S |
| | 04/06/97-04/10/97 | 1 | EP | S | S |
| | 07/18/97-07/23/97 | 2 | EP, IS | S | S |
| | 02/03/98-02/17/98 | 6 | EP, EC, ES, AA, CO, RA | S | S |
| | 01/25/99-02/06/99 | 8 | TL, HRE, OA, PS, FMS, IS, ES, LA | S | S |
| ICR | 06/12/00-06/19/00 | 6 | TL, EC, PA, ES, | S | S |
| | 01/13/01-01/19/01 | 3 | EE, OA TL, ES, EC | HS | HS |

AA = Administrative Assistant; AR = Architect; CO = Consultant; EP = Education Planner; EC = Economist; ES = Education Specialist; EE = Environment Educator; FMS = Financial Management Specialist; HRE = Human Resources Economist; IS = Implementation Specialist; LA = Lawyer; OA = Operations Analyst; PA = Program Assistant; PS = Procurement Specialist; RA = Research Assistant; TL = Team Leader;



BEST COPY AVAILABLE

## Other Project Data

Borrower/Executing Agency:

### *FOLLOW-ON OPERATIONS*

### *LIST OF SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS*


- Bray, Mark. Secondary School Examinations in the Republic of Maldives: Current Modes and Future Policies, 1999.
- Education Master Plan Team. Education Master Plan (1996-2005), Prepared for the Ministry of Education, Republic of the Maldives with support from the Hickling Foundation and Asian Development Bank, 1995.
- Johnston, Ian, Study on Examinations and Assessment a the Primary/Extended Primary and Secondary Levels in the Republic of Maldives, Interim Report, 1999.
- Ministry of Education, Male', Republic of Maldives. Educational Statistics, 1995-2000 (published annually).
- Ministry of Planning and National Development, Male', Republic of Maldives. Statistical Yearbook of Maldives, 2000.
- Rawlinson Consulting Services. Post Secondary Education Study. Republic of the Maldives, 1997.
- Waheed, Ibrahim, Impact Study: SETP Meeting Management and Administrative Skills at the IMA, 2000.
- World Bank. Development Credit Agreement (Cr. 2701-MAL), May 1, 1995.
- World Bank. Implementation Completion Report, Education and Training Project (Cr. 1981-MAL), June 18, 1996.
- World Bank. Staff Appraisal Report for the Second Education and Training Project, February 22, 1995.
- World Bank. Supervision/Site Visit Reports, 1996-2000.


BEST COPY AVAILABLE

**U.S. Department of Education**
*Office of Educational Research and Improvement (OERI)*
*National Library of Education (NLE)*
*Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC)*

# NOTICE

## Reproduction Basis

[X] This document is covered by a signed "Reproduction Release (Blanket)" form (on file within the ERIC system), encompassing all or classes of documents from its source organization and, therefore, does not require a "Specific Document" Release form.

[ ] This document is Federally-funded, or carries its own permission to reproduce, or is otherwise in the public domain and, therefore, may be reproduced by ERIC without a signed Reproduction Release form (either "Specific Document" or "Blanket").